

DELEGATED ASSESSMENT

Application no: PA/2020/1706

Proposal: Planning permission to erect an emergency care extension to the existing hospital, alterations and enhancements to existing ambulance drop-off, demolition of existing administration building adjacent to the Cliff Gardens site, new car park deck above existing public parking spaces adjacent to the Church Lane entrance, new electricity sub station and installation of staff cycle facilities.

Location: Scunthorpe General Hospital, Cliff Gardens, Scunthorpe, DN15 7BH

Applicant: Mr Jug Johal

Officer: Tanya Coggon

POLICY

NPPF: Chapters 2, 4,8, 9, 12, 14,15, 16

Core Strategy: CS1, CS2, CS3, CS5, CS6, CS17, CS18, CS19, CS22, CS24, CS25

North Lincolnshire Local Plan: T1, T2, T8, T19, HE9, DS1, DS3, DS7, DS11, DS14, DS16,

Housing and Employment DPD: PS1

SPD: Planning for Health and Well Being

CONSULTATIONS

Highways: No objections subject to conditions in relation to the submission of travel plans, car parking construction plan and the emergency department not been brought into use until the car park deck is operational.

LLFA: No objection subject to conditions in relation to the submission of a surface water drainage scheme.

EA: Do not wish to comment on the application.

Severn Trent Water: No response

Anglian Water: The development falls outside their statutory sewage boundary so no comments.

Humberside Police: No objections

Humberside Fire and Rescue Service: Comments in relation to water supplies for fire fighting and access for the fire service.

Ecology: No objection subject to the submission of a biodiversity managing plan, details of electrical vehicle charging points and proposals for renewable energy/net zero carbon

Trees: No comments

Environmental Protection: No objection subject to conditions in relation to remediation, the development carried out in accordance with the submitted noise impact assessment, restrictions on construction, demolition and site clearance, submission of a CEMP, provision of Electrical Vehicle Charging Points

Public Health: Supports the comments made by Environmental Health, the LLFA, the ecology officer and highways.

HER: The Scunthorpe War Memorial Hospital building is a non-designated heritage asset recorded on the council's Historic Environment Record. The building has historic and architectural interest, and is of high communal value to the population of Scunthorpe and district. The proposal to demolish this building to make way for the new emergency extension would result in substantial harm to the non-designated heritage asset. The heritage considerations should inform the planning decision and be given due weight in the planning balance in accordance with paragraph 197 of the NPPF. The preferred option would be to retain this building and seek an alternative site for the extension. Where the planning authority considers the loss of the building is justified and is minded to grant permission for this application, conditions to secure the implementation of appropriate mitigation measures would be necessary. The applicant has submitted a Heritage Statement that proposes the dismantling and relocation of the entrance archway to form a pedestrian access off Cliff Gardens, subject to assessment. The HER supports this proposal but recommends that the assessment is carried out prior to the determination of the application to inform the decision. A programme of historic building recording prior to any demolition should be undertaken and standard planning conditions are suggested below.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

The Trust have carried out community involvement on the scheme. These include publicising the proposals on Facebook, on the website, engagement meetings on site with TV screens and printed boards with staff available to respond to any questions. Feedback was positive with the main concerns relating to the demolition of the WMH and the impact on car parking.

PUBLICITY

The original and amended plans have been advertised in the press, by sites notices and on the council's website.

LETTERS OF COMMENT

7 letters of comment have been received. There is 1 letter of support and 6 letters of objection (2 from the same objector). The following issues have been raised in these letters:

- Parking close to bedroom windows
- Engine fumes discharging into residential properties and gardens
- Increased noise
- Has a study been done in increase of noise to local residents
- Car park should be built elsewhere on the site
- Adjacent car park in the pit could be used
- No need for additional car parking there is sufficient parking on the site
- Car park will be an eyesore
- Noise survey not taken near the residential properties
- The scheme does not reflect government guidelines to encourage greater use of public transport
- Car park located at a level height and within 1m of bedrooms, lounge, kitchen and dining room of a dwelling currently under construction
- Block plan does not show approved dwelling under construction
- Overlooking into properties and gardens.
- Has a contamination survey been carried out.

MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

The Proposal

The proposal involves 4 principle elements:

Demolition of admin building (War Memorial Hospital)

Erection of new Emergency Department

Erection of new car park over existing car park

Erection of a new sub station

Demolition of Admin Building

The complete demolition of the War Memorial Hospital (WMH) used as an admin building is required to facilitate the new emergency department. The War Memorial Hospital was opened in 1929 and is a non designated heritage asset. The building has historic and architectural interest, and is of high communal value to the population of Scunthorpe and district. The WMH building is of brick with stone dressings in the late 17th century style influenced by Sir Christopher Wren. The architect was W.H. Buttrick of Scunthorpe. It is an architecturally pleasing building with an imposing symmetrical frontage and fine entrance portico comprising a stone arch with columns and pediment containing the engraved dates 1929 and 1914-1918 Scunthorpe General Hospital. The new emergency department will be

constructed over the footprint of the admin building and extended towards the eastern boundary of the site.

New Emergency Department

The proposed building will result in the demolition to WMH and the loss of existing staff car parking on the site. The new emergency department (ED) will be essentially a single storey building and will approximately 69m in width, 39m, in depth and 9.65 (maximum) in height. A small area is to be provided at first floor level to provide plant equipment and an external staircase is proposed. The new ED will front Cliff Gardens and this is where the main entrance will be. Ambulance drop off bays will also be provided at the front of the building with a canopy provided on the front elevation. The building will mainly be constructed from cladding, brickwork, aluminium windows and windows and glazed panels to the main entrance. Internally the new ED will provide waiting areas, cubicles, offices, staff facilities, stores, utility rooms and a CT scanner room. The existing ED will be used for same day emergency care/assessment in conjunction with the new ED.

Erection of New Substation

The sub station is required to provide essential infrastructure to facilitate the new emergency department. It is located close to the eastern boundary of the site adjacent to the new ED. It is essentially 8.53m in height, 20.18m in length and 9.19m in width (maximum). The substation will comprise 2 floors. The ground floor will accommodate a the generator, transformer and manifold accommodation. The first floor will house the LV switch room. The building will have an external staircase and a compound surrounded by a weld mesh fence and gates. Externally the building will comprise composite cladding panels, metal louvered doors and walls and a brick plinth.

Erection of New Car Park Deck

The erection of the new ED and substation will result in the loss of car parking spaces on the site. In order to provide additional car parking on the site a new car park deck will be installed over an existing visitor car park adjacent to the Church Lane entrance. The original plans showed this deck to car park 4 but due to technical/feasibility constraints including prevention of access for the mobile MRI scanner, levels and a gas pipeline the car park deck had to be resited above car park 3. The ramp to the deck is on the western side of the car park. It has had to be located in this position to form acceptable access arrangements. Locating the ramp on the eastern side was explored by SGH but was proved to be unfeasible due to unacceptable access arrangements and site constraints.

The new car deck will provide staff parking onto the first floor for 77 vehicles. A ramp located adjacent to the western boundary of the site will provide access to the car park deck. The existing ground level car park 3 will continue to be used as visitor car parking and will accommodate 70 spaces with 2 access on ground level to serve the existing ground floor car park. The new car park deck will be 73m wide (including the ramp), width approximately 33m deep and 4.8m high from ground level. The car park

deck will be an open structure with pillars and will be enclosed on the elevations (1-3 north, east and south) by hit and miss timber fencing over just over 2m in height and a metal barrier for vehicle safety with a close boarded acoustic fence on elevation 1 (west) of a height of just over 2m and a metal barrier for vehicle safety. External staircases are proposed from the ground floor to the deck to provide pedestrian access to and from the deck.

The Site

The site is Scunthorpe General Hospital with access from Cliff Gardens and Church Lane. Scunthorpe General Hospital comprises part of the original War Memorial Hospital now used as admin building with various extensions and additions added to the hospital site since the 1930's. Much of the original buildings have become subsumed into or been replaced by many more modern buildings of various sizes, types and designs, with the War Memorial Hospital range being the only visible survival .

The site is located with the urban area of Scunthorpe. The site is surrounded by residential properties to the north, east and west. To the south are residential properties and staff accommodation for the hospital and the staff car park known as 'the pit'. The site is located in Flood Zone 1 and is therefore at low risk of flooding.

Principle

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires planning applications to be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. Such other important considerations include other relevant policy and guidance, particularly national planning policy in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and other relevant Government policy statements, as well as that which is provided within the National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG). Furthermore, paragraph 47 of the NPPF confirms that "planning law requires applications for planning permission be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

In terms of the NPPF the proposal is considered to be sustainable development. The proposed development will secure net gains across the key economic, social and environmental objectives which will be discussed in more detail latter sections of this assessment.. The proposal will create construction jobs and provide new staffing opportunities. The proposed will allow an existing health care facility to develop and modernise and provide improved facilities for the benefit of residents of North Lincolnshire. The proposal will incorporate sustainable transport modes, renewable energy, biodiversity enhancements on the site. The proposal therefore aligns with the key principles of the NPPF in relation to sustainable development. Chapter 8 of the NPPF relates to the promotion of healthy and safe communities. Paragraph 92 of the NPPF supports the provision of services the community needs.

Policy PS1 of the HELA DPD states that when considering development proposals the Council will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the National Planning Policy Framework. The council will always work proactively with applicants jointly to find solutions which

mean that proposals can be approved wherever possible, and to secure development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions in the area. Planning applications that accord with the policies in this Local Plan will be approved without delay, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The proposal therefore accords with policy PS1.

In terms of the Core Strategy, the proposal accords with the strategic objectives of CS1 as Scunthorpe is the main focus for new development and higher order services and facilities to serve North Lincolnshire.

Policy CS2 seeks to ensure a sequential approach is adopted with development focused on previously developed land and buildings within the Scunthorpe urban area with development directed to those areas that have the lowest probability of flooding. Policy CS2 also sets out a number of sustainable development principles including minimising the need to travel, development located to existing transport infrastructure, contribute towards to the creation of locally distinctive, sustainable, inclusive, healthy and vibrant communities, contribute to achieving sustainable economic development to support a competitive business and industrial sector, ensure that everyone has access to health facilities that they need for their daily lives and ensure the appropriate provision of services, facilities and infrastructure to meet the needs of the development. The proposed development aligns with the sustainable objectives of CS2.

Policy CS22 permits provision of new community facilities, or the improvement of existing community facilities, which meet the needs of local residents will be supported in principle. Good quality services and facilities will be provided that meet the needs of local communities and are accessible by public transport, cycling or on foot. The new ED facility on the SGH site will align with this policy.

Policy CS24 of the Core Strategy support the implementation of health care provision in North Lincolnshire, in order to modernise and improve the primary health care facilities. Proposals for new health care facilities should provide high standards of accessibility to all sectors of the community. The proposal will accord with this policy as a new modern, purpose built ED will be provided on a highly accessible site within the urban area of Scunthorpe.

Policy CS25 of the Core Strategy seeks to support and promote a sustainable transport system in North Lincolnshire that offers a choice of transport modes and reduces the need to travel through spatial planning and design and by utilising a range of demand and network management tools. The proposal will support and promote sustainable transport as the site is highly accessible by a choice of transport modes. SGH has a number of travel plans and initiatives in place to encourage sustainable transport including car sharing, cycle to work schemes, park and ride scheme, shuttle bus service, electrical fleet vehicles for example.

The proposal therefore is considered to align with the overarching strategic objectives of the NPPF and of the adopted HELA DPD and Core Strategy. An assessment will now be made upon the technical merits of the proposal.

Design

In terms of design of the scheme, the new built form will be the new ED, substation and car park deck. In terms of the ED this is a modern, functional building that will provide update emergency facilities for staff and patients. SGH has a mix of buildings of various types and sizes as SGH has been extended on a piecemeal basis over the years to accommodate increased demand and the changes of services, practices and facilities. The ED is not considered to be out of character with the main hospital site and will be integrated into the built form of the overall SGH site. The building is set well back from Cliff Gardens and will not result in an adverse character impacts on the amenity of the locality. The proposal therefore accords with CS5 of the Core Strategy and DS1 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

The sub station is also a functional building required to serve the new ED. It is located adjacent to the ED and well back from Cliff Gardens. The trees on the site frontage to Cliff Gardens provide some screening as do the existing buildings to the east and south. The substation will be viewed in context with the whole of the hospital site and will not appear out of character with the site. The location of the sub station will not have an adverse impacts on the amenity of the locality. The proposal therefore accords with CS5 of the Core Strategy and DS1 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

In terms of the car park deck this is located adjacent to the Church Lane entrance of the site. It will be highly visible from Church Lane. The position of the car park deck had to change during the application process due to feasibility issues and site constraints. SGH did investigate other locations for the new car park deck on the SGH site and adjacent to 'The Pit' but all options were explored and discounted. These are set out in the submitted Design and Access Statement. The only available site for the car park deck is above the existing visitor car park no 3 which lies adjacent to Church Lane and adjacent to residential properties along Church Lane and Newland Avenue.

The car park deck has been designed is pillars, enclosed by timber fencing on the deck with the ground car park remaining open. The car park deck will be viewed in context with the hospital site and residential properties. The design of the car deck is a utilitarian design. The deck and ramp and have been kept as low as possible to reduce its impact on the site, on adjacent properties and on the surrounding area. The external finishes of the deck will be agreed by the use of a planning condition. The design of the deck is a fairly open functional building and is required in conjunction with the new ED to provide replacement car parking on the site for visitors and staff. Therefore on balance, the design of new car park deck is considered to be acceptable in design terms and accords with CS5 of the Core Strategy and DS1 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

The scheme provides a number of crime prevention initiatives within the proposed schemes. These include natural surveillance Humberside Police have been consulted on the proposal and raised no objections to the proposal. The proposal therefore accords with policy DS3 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan and policy CS5 of the Core Strategy.

Heritage

The proposed development will result in the demolition of the WMH on the site. The WMH is a non-designated heritage asset. The original WMH building provides legibility to the history and development of the hospital site as well as the changing design and demands of hospital building over time. The building has historic and architectural interest, and is of high communal value to the population of Scunthorpe and district. The proposal to demolish this building to make way for the new emergency extension would result in substantial harm to the non-designated heritage asset.

Alternative Options

Paragraphs 190 and 192 of the NPPF and consider whether there are any alternatives for retaining the War Memorial Hospital with a viable use that would conserve its heritage benefits to the local community and maintain the character and distinctiveness of the Scunthorpe hospital site. SGH have submitted a robust justification for the loss of the WMH. A Heritage Statement has been submitted with the application which was subsequently amended to provide justification for the loss of the WMH. The building is in a poor condition, it is not suitable for the delivery of modern healthcare, have poor thermal performance and limited accessibility. SGH have looked at various options which are set out in the Heritage Statements to retain the WMH and resite the new ED elsewhere of the hospital site or incorporate the WMH within the new ED. All the proposals have been discounted as resiting the new ED elsewhere on the SGH will result in loss of car parking, poor co-location with the existing emergency care services and assessment units, major changes to ambulance routes, clashes between public and emergency routes, level differences across the site, closer to residential properties. To incorporate the WMH into the new ED would result in loss of footprint for the ED, accessibility issues, new build limited by levels, constrained layout of the ED, adverse impact on patient flows, reduced connectivity between departments and assessment units.

The council have assessed all the submitted information in relation to the demolition of the WNH. It is regrettable that this building is to be lost as it is a non designated heritage asset that is of historical and architectural importance to Scunthorpe. However, this must be balanced against the need for the new ED facility which will provide significant health care benefits to residents of Scunthorpe and North Lincolnshire and beyond in terms of improved health care facilities at SGH. It should also be noted that no objections have been received in relation to the loss of the WMH. SGH will benefit from a purpose built ED allow staff to carry out their duties more efficiently and effectively and there will be greater connectivity across the SGH departments. It is clear that the WMH is now unfit for purpose and a new more modern and functional ED is required on the site to meet the needs of residents and clinical staff. Funding has been granted for the scheme and it has been clearly demonstrated to the council that the proposed development if approved will proceed and be delivered. Paragraph 197 of the NPPF directs local planning authorities that in the case of non-designated heritage assets, a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage

asset. In this case it is considered that the public benefits of the scheme do significantly and demonstrably outweigh the dis-benefits and therefore the provision of the new emergency care facility on the site does outweigh the loss of the WMH. The proposal therefore complies with paragraphs 190, 192 and 199 of the NPPF and policy CS6 of the Core Strategy.

Mitigation

In terms of the mitigation the loss of the WMH a number of options have proposed by SGH. These have included retaining the entrance archway of the WMH and resiting elsewhere on the site, retaining the original inscribed stones from the entrance into the new ED entrance, replicating the archway entrance onto the new ED, providing a written and photographic record of the building. The removal of the archway and rebuilt/replaced onto the main entrance of the new ED is not feasible due to the conflicts with accessibility, functional use of the building, and the overall design. Automatic entrance doors would not be able to be installed within the width of the archway. The removal of the archway and replaced elsewhere on the site reduces the historic significance and understanding of the WMH building. The site is very developed and there limited places where the entrance archway could be relocated where the historical and architectural context could be understood. It has therefore been decided that the most acceptable form of mitigation is for the entrance stones (inscribed stones and triangular plinth on the WMH) to be installed within the new ED entrance with a small plaque explaining the significance of these stones. This would provide evidence of the WMH's historic and architectural significance and the position of the stones in the new entrance of the ED reflect their former position in the WMH entrance. A photographic/Level 2 building record will also be carried out for the WMH and conditions proposed by HER will be imposed on the planning permission. The proposal therefore complies with paragraphs 190, 192 and 199 of the NPPF and policy CS6 of the Core Strategy

Highways

In terms of highways, SGH have submitted a number of transport documents with their application including a transport assessment (TA) and construction phased traffic management plan and details of car parking on the site. proposed ED will be built on an existing staff car park and replacement car parking in the form of a new car park deck is proposed above the existing visitor car park 3. At SGH there is currently 286 spaces onsite for visitors and outpatients and 249 on site staff car parking spaces with 535 spaces are offsite. The proposed deck car park will have a total of 70 visitor / outpatient spaces on the lower level and 77 staff spaces on the upper deck. Overall, the proposed development will result in a net gain of 13 onsite standard staff parking spaces and a loss of 25 onsite (barriered) visitor / outpatient standard parking spaces. The existing cycle storage adjacent to the WMH will be demolished as a result of the proposed development and this will be relocated adjacent to the car park 3.

SGH is a very accessible site. There are motorcycle and cycle storage facilities on the site. The site is accessible by cycling, walking and bus stops are located outside the hospital entrances. A park and ride scheme operates to the hospital. A number of

administration posts are to be relocated from the SGH site to Beacon House on Kingsway and some staff are home working. The Trust has a travel plan in place to encourage use of public transport, car sharing, cycling for example. The submitted TA provides evidence that the proposed development will result in a net decrease in vehicle trips and the consolidation of staff parking. It is therefore, considered that it will have a negligible impact on the highway network. It has also been demonstrated within the submission documents that there are no road safety concerns in the vicinity of the site.

Highways have been consulted on the proposals and raise no objections subject to conditions in relation to the submission of travel plans, the development being carried out in accordance with the submitted construction phase car parking plan and the construction phase traffic management plan and the emergency department not been brought into use until the car park deck is operational. These conditions are necessary to ensure sustainable transport for the scheme, to ensure that during construction of the development, adequate car parking for staff and visitors and contractors is managed correctly and to ensure that during construction no adverse impacts will occur on the highway network. Once the ED is completed adequate car parking through the completion of the new deck will be provided on the SGH site for staff and visitors. The proposal subject to conditions therefore accords with the NPPF, policies T1, T2, T8, T19 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan and policy CS25 of the Core Strategy.

Flood Risk and Drainage

In terms of Flood Risk the scheme is a major development and SGH have submitted a Flood Risk Assessment (FRA) and a drainage strategy. The site is located in Flood Zone 1 of the council's SFRA 2011 and is therefore at low risk of flooding. The SFRA is the most up-to-date flood risk assessment for North Lincolnshire. The Environment Agency does not wish to comment on this application. As the site lies within an area at low risk of flooding, the proposal is considered to be acceptable in terms of flood risk and aligns with the NPPF, policy CS19 of the Core Strategy and policy DS16 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

In terms of drainage, SGH have submitted drainage strategies. Severn Trent Water has been consulted on the proposal, but has not commented on the application. If the developer wishes to connect to the sewerage network they would need to serve notice under Section 106 of the Water Industry Act 1991. A planning condition will be used to ensure that details of the disposal of foul water from the site are submitted to the council for approval and Seven Trent Water would be consulted on the scheme. The proposal would therefore accord with policies CS18 and CS19 of the Core Strategy, and DS14 and DS16 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

In terms of surface water the LLFA, Severn Trent Water and the Environment Agency have all been consulted on the proposal. The Environment Agency does not wish to comment on the proposal and Severn Trent Water has not responded. LLFA have no objections to the proposal subject to planning conditions to requiring the submission of a detailed surface water drainage scheme which demonstrates that surface water run-off generated up to and including the 1 in 100 year critical storm

will not exceed the run-off from the existing site. It will also need to include details of how the resulting completed scheme is to be maintained and managed for the lifetime of the development so that flood risk, both on and off the site, is not increased. This aspect of the proposal, subject to conditions, would therefore accord with the NPPF, policies CS18 and CS19 of the Core Strategy, and DS14 and DS16 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan

Biodiversity

In terms of biodiversity this is a urban site which the majority of the site covered by buildings and hardstanding areas and therefore has limited biodiversity value. SGH have submitted an ecology appraisal and a bat survey with their application. The council's ecologist has been consulted on the proposals and has assessed all the submitted information. The NPPF seeks to provide biodiversity net gains and opportunities to incorporate biodiversity in and around developments should be encouraged. In order to provide biodiversity enhancements on the site planning conditions are proposed to ensure a biodiversity management plan is submitted which includes details of bat roosting and nesting features, restrictions on lighting to avoid impacts on bats and birds and details for planting and after care of trees and shrubs. The proposal therefore aligns with the NPPF and policies CS5 and CS17 of the Core Strategy.

Renewable energy

Policy CS18 of the North Lincolnshire Core Strategy outlines the council's standard for sustainable design and renewable energy in non-residential developments and stipulates that all non-residential developments of more than 1000 square metres must achieve at least a 20% reduction in predicted annual regulated energy generation, from renewable sources.

Within the SGH's submission a sustainability statement has been submitted which refers to reduced operational carbon footprint, promotion of sustainable travel, including electrical charging points, cycle storage and consideration of a park-and-ride system, the building fabric will achieve high levels of airtightness, minimising uncontrolled heat loss and allowing precise control over the internal environment, the building will have high standards of insulation, the building will benefit from the latest energy efficient plant systems, energy efficient lighting, non-clinical water use will be minimised through the specification of appropriate sanitaryware, the building fabric, internally and externally, will be designed to be robust, reducing future maintenance requirements and attenuated drainage to reduce run-off rates. Planning conditions will be used to secure a renewable energy production equipment for the site and to ensure that details of cycle facilities and electrical vehicle charging points will be provided on the site by virtue of a planning conditions. The development will therefore align with CS18 of the Core Strategy.

Trees and Landscaping

There are some trees on the site and some hedging and small landscaping planting areas. A small number of trees adjacent to the car park have had to be removed to

facilitate the car park development. These trees are not protected as they are not covered by Tree Preservation Orders or are located within the Conservation Area and therefore can be removed with no formal consent of the council. In order to improve the aesthetic appearance of the site and introduce new planting to replace the felled trees, a landscaping planning condition is proposed to ensure additional tree and landscaping planting is provided on the site. The proposal therefore accords with DS1 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan and policy CS5 of the Core Strategy.

Contamination and environmental issues

In terms of contamination and environmental issues a number of reports have been submitted by SGH. These include site investigation reports, contaminated land assessment, geo-technical assessments noise impact assessments and an air quality assessment. These documents have been assessed by Environmental Health.

In terms of contamination various reports have been submitted by SGH which have been assessed by Environmental Health. Environmental Health have recommended that a planning condition is used to ensure that if any contaminated material is found on the site a method statement is submitted to the council detailing how the contamination will be dealt with. This aspect of the proposal would align with policy DS7 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

In terms of the air quality assessment, Environmental Health are recommending EVC points to be provided on the site which can be dealt with by a planning condition. SGH have submitted an EMP and emails to demonstrate that The proposal would therefore align with CS18 of the Core Strategy and DS11 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

A noise impact assessment with mitigation measures has been submitted and assessed by Environmental Health. This is largely associated with the potential noise and vibration impacts of construction and operation of a new Emergency Department, and associated changes to parking provision on the site.

The assessment has considered mitigation of construction noise and vibration, emission of noise from vehicles using the proposed two-storey car park, and an approach to setting limits for noise from new building services plant. This assessment concluded that in relation to the car parking with appropriate mitigation, there will be no adverse impacts due to implementation of the parking proposals. Plant installations will be specified such that rating level as defined in BS4142:2014+A1 2019 does not exceed the prevailing background noise levels set out in the assessment. For existing buildings within the hospital site, noise emitted from proposed building services plant should be controlled such that the criteria for building services noise in assessment are not exceeded as a result of implementation of the proposed development.

Environmental are raising no objections subject to conditions relating to restrictions on working hours, construction works are carried out in accordance with the submitted CEMP and emails from the developer and the development shall be constructed in accordance with the recommendations made in the submitted Noise

Impact Assessment. The proposal would therefore align with DS1 and DS11 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

Impact on residents

ED and Substation

In terms of residents there has been no objections from residents to the new ED and substation or to the demolition of the WMH. The new ED and substation is set back from Cliff Gardens within the main hospital site and are a significant distance from neighbours. The design and layout does not result in any demonstrable harm to the amenity of neighbours through overlooking, being overbearing for example. The new ED and sub station are both of modern designs and reflect some of the existing buildings on the site. Both these aspects will not result in any loss of visual amenity to surrounding neighbours. Planning conditions are proposed to limit construction hours and the submitted noise survey, CEMP and associated information will protect residents from noise and disturbance during the construction and demolition phase of the development. The new ED in effect replaces the existing ED on the site and therefore this is unlikely to be any significant increase in noise and disturbance to neighbours generated by the new buildings. This aspect of the proposal therefore aligns with policy CS5 of the Core Strategy and Policy DS1 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

Car Park Deck

The majority of the comments relate to increase car parking on the site and the proposed car park deck. In terms of car parking, there will not be an increase in car parking on the site. The new ED will result in the loss of car parking spaces and these will be replaced on the car park deck. There will actually be a small loss of car parking spaces overall on the SGH site. SGH has submitted details of sustainable transport and travel plans in place. The site is located in a sustainable and accessible location. On site parking is required for patients and visitors and staff, otherwise this will lead to further pressures for car parking on surrounding streets and roads resulting in additional hazards to vehicle and pedestrian safety. Highways also consider that the car park deck is required to replace the car parking spaces lost by the construction of the new ED.

The new car park will be located adjacent to properties on Newland Avenue and Church Lane. There is already a visitor car park on this site and the deck will be built above this car park. The concerns from neighbours are noted. The reasons for the new car park deck to be located above this existing car park(3) have been discussed in the earlier section of this assessment and within the submitted design and access statement.

In terms of overlooking the car park deck will be surrounded by a timber fence of 1.8m high from first floor level on the western site, adjacent to the ramp. On the other elevations a 1.8m high hit and miss timber fence from first floor level will be provided around the deck. This will prevent overlooking from users of the car park when users are in vehicles or on foot. The nearest proposed staircase to the car park deck

is located approximately 20m from the rear boundaries of properties along Newland Avenue so no demonstrable overlooking will be caused to neighbours from staff using the external staircase.

In terms of noise, the noise assessment recommends that a noise barrier is incorporated along the western edge of the vehicle ramp and along the western elevation of the upper storey of the car-park. The noise barrier should be acoustically absorptive on the carpark side to reduce the potential for reflection of vehicle noise. Environmental Health have been consulted on the proposal and raise no objections subject to the development being carried out in accordance with the noise assessment which will form a planning condition. In addition a condition a planning condition is proposed for the submission of the specification and external finish of the fencing to ensure that the use of the car park and ramp will not result in demonstrable loss of amenity by increase noise and disturbance to neighbours on Church Lane and Newland Avenue. The proposal will therefore accord with the NPPF, DS1 and DS11 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan and CS5 of the Core Strategy.

In terms of the visual impact of the car park it is accepted that the car park will be located close to the rear gardens of a small number of properties along Newland Avenue and adjacent to a new dwelling being constructed on Church Lane. Turning first to the properties on Newland Avenue. There are 2 properties (no.87 and no.85) that share a boundary with the existing car park where the car park deck is proposed. They will have a view of the western elevation of the new car park deck and ramp from their rear gardens and dwelling. There is a distance of 17-18m from these dwellings to the proposed car park deck. The car park deck and ramp is enclosed by close boarded fencing on the west elevation with the rest of the structure relatively open as pillars will be used to support the car park deck. There will be some loss of visual amenity to these small numbers of properties on Newland Avenue that adjoin the car park. The deck has been kept to a low height as it has a maximum height of 4.8m from ground level. The structure of the deck and ramp is not designed as a solid wall but is an open structure with pillars that is enclosed by a fence. Planning conditions will be used to require the external finishes of the building to be submitted to the council for approval to ensure the visual appearance of the building is acceptable in terms of visual amenity.

An objection has been received from an objector who has stating that he is constructing an approved dwelling on Church Lane which lies adjacent to the car park deck. At the time of the site visit, no visible works had occurred on the site associated with this new dwelling. This dwelling was approved under PA/2020/262 and is a detached dwelling with its eastern boundary located adjacent to the car park deck. This approved plans for this property show no windows in its eastern elevation. On the front elevation, facing south will be a lounge window and 2 bedroom windows. In its rear elevation at first floor level are 2 bedroom and a bathroom window and at ground floor are a kitchen and dining room window. These windows face north and look over the garden of the approved dwelling. From the bedroom windows there will be a view of the car park deck which comprises the ramp, pillars, and close boarded fencing. The car park will be a maximum height of 4.8m and will be a similar height to the eaves of this dwelling. Overlooking to this property will be prevented by the proposed fencing and noise mitigation measures

are proposed by planning conditions. There will be some loss of visual amenity and outlook caused to this dwelling (if built) by the new car park as it will be located immediately adjacent to proposed dwelling's eastern boundary. The deck is a relatively open structure with its pillars allowing light to pass to this dwelling. Whilst there will be some loss of amenity to the eastern side, the rear garden shares a boundary with the rear gardens of 110 Church Lane and 87 Newland Avenue so the garden of this approved dwelling will not be fully enclosed by buildings. It must be noted that the dwelling is currently not constructed on the site and is therefore not occupied at the present time. The owner has bought a site in full knowledge that it is adjacent to an existing hospital and immediately adjacent to an existing visitor car park at ground level. Any future occupier/purchaser of this dwelling will purchase or live in this property in full awareness of the car park deck. Furthermore circumstances may change leading to the proposed dwelling being implemented but not completed for example.

In terms of 110 Church Lane, this is located approximately 10m from the car park deck. If the approved dwelling PA/2020/262 is constructed and completed it will screen some of the car park deck from 110 Church Lane, with the car park deck being visible from the rear and front of this property. Due to the design of the car park deck and the distance from this property together with the noise mitigation measures, even if the dwelling approved under PA/2020/262 is not built, no demonstrable loss of amenity will be caused to this property by the proposed development.

As a result it is considered on balance whilst there is some loss of visual amenity/outlook to these properties on Church Lane and Newland Avenue, it is not such significant harm that a refusal could be justified when balanced against all the wider public benefits of the scheme. The proposal on balance accords with DS1 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan and CS5 of the Core Strategy.

Planning conditions

The council has engaged with the SGH and discussed all the proposed conditions for the development. This has been necessary as the development comprises a number of elements which will be commenced on the site at different times. All conditions attached to this recommendation have been agreed with the applicant.

Conclusion

The scheme will provide a modern, functional ED for the residents of North Lincolnshire and for staff, improved infrastructure in the form of the new sub station and improved car parking on the site. Improvements to biodiversity, tree planting, renewable energy, ECV charging points, improved cycling facilities will be provided on the site. Jobs will be created during the construction process contributing to the economy of North Lincolnshire. This has to be balanced against the loss of the WMH and the construction of a car park deck adjacent to residential properties. This assessment has carefully assessed all the planning issues associated with the site. When the planning balance is applied, the benefits of providing a new purpose built, modern, functional, efficient ED for residents of North Lincolnshire this clearly outweighs the loss of the WMH and the loss of visual amenity/outlook to neighbours

through the installation of the car park deck. As a result when the planning balance is applied, it is considered that the benefits of the proposal demonstrably outweigh the dis-benefits of the proposal.

RECOMMENDATION:

Grant planning permission subject to conditions