

DELEGATED ASSESSMENT

Application no: PA/2022/1464

Proposal: Planning permission to erect a two-storey extension to the south side of the existing dwelling house and associated works

Location: Old Manor House, Main Street, Whitton, DN15 9LL

Applicant: Mr and Mrs Drayton

Officer: Jess Hill

POLICY

National Planning Policy Framework: Section 12 (Achieving well-designed places)

North Lincolnshire Local Plan: Policies DS1, DS5, HE5

North Lincolnshire Core Strategy: Policies CS1, CS2, CS3, CS5, CS6

CONSULTATIONS

Highways: I would advise that the following condition should be applied to any permission that you may be minded to grant: HW1

Drainage: It is noted that the existing property roof water discharges onto the highway. There is an opportunity to remove this and provide a new soakaway outfall for all roof and hard paved areas of the site as part of this development. Taking this into consideration the LLFA Drainage Team has no objection to the proposed development subject to the imposition of a condition requiring details showing an effective method of preventing surface water run-off from hard paved areas within the site onto the highway

Historic Environment Record: The Old Manor House is an unlisted historic building believed to date from the late 17th century. An archaeological test pit within the application site recovered a number of pottery sherds of Roman, Saxon and medieval date and further archaeological remains may be anticipated. The planning application should include measures to ensure that any archaeological evidence impacted by the proposed development is identified and recorded in advance of and during construction, in relation to the historic building and below-ground remains. A Written Scheme of Investigation (WSI) for historic standing building recording and a programme of archaeological monitoring and recording during all groundworks should be submitted prior to determination of the planning application. Should the planning authority ultimately be minded to grant consent, any permission should be subject to conditions securing the implementation of an agreed WSI; pre-commencement conditions would only be necessary where an agreed WSI is not in place.

Conservation: Objection. This application has a negative impact on the setting and significance of The Grove listed grade II and the character and appearance of the Old Manor House a non-designated heritage assets, and the local character and distinctiveness of Whitton and should be refused.

Councillors: No responses received

PARISH / TOWN COUNCIL

Whitton Parish Council: No response received

PUBLICITY

A site notice has been displayed in accordance with Article 15 of the Development Management Procedure Order 2015 (as amended).

LETTERS OF COMMENT

Two objections have been received, which highlight the following key concerns:

- Overlooking / loss of privacy
- Overshadowing
- Overbearing structure
- Inappropriate nature of the design (harmful impact on the setting of the Grove which is a grade II listed building)

MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Site Location and Context

The site comprises a two storey semi-detached dwelling location within the village of Whitton.

Planning History

7/1974/0118 Change the use of land for use as a road haulage depot in connection with business as a stockfeed buyer & supplier – refused 30 May 1974

7/1988/0977 Erect 2 detached houses – approved 08 December 1988

Designations / Constraints

Within the development limits of Whitton

Not within a Conservation Area. There is a grade II listed building (The Grove) approximately 27m to the south west of the dwelling

No Tree Protection Orders on the site

Within SFRA Flood Zone 1

Proposal

The application seeks consent to erect a two-storey extension to the south side of the existing dwelling.

Principle of Development

Householder alterations are acceptable in principle subject to there being no harm to the character and appearance of the property through unsympathetic design or harm to the amenity of neighbouring properties and residential areas. The site is within the development boundary of Whitton and is located opposite The Grove (a grade II listed building).

The following considerations are relevant to this proposal:

- Design and Appearance
- Heritage Impacts
- Residential Amenity

Design and Appearance

Policy DS5 (Residential Extensions) states that proposals should be sympathetic in design, scale and materials.

Policy CS5 (Delivering Quality Design in North Lincolnshire) is also concerned with visual amenity and seeks to achieve quality design in North Lincolnshire.

The existing dwelling comprises the Old Manor House which is an unlisted historic building recording on the Historic Environment Record (HER).

The nearest listed building is The Grove (Grade II listed), which is approximately 20m to the south west of the site, also on Main Street.

Both The Grove and the Old Manor House feature prominently on the street scene on the approach into Whitton.

The council's records indicate that the Old Manor House was constructed in the late 17th century, with a recorded date mark of 1687, and potentially has earlier origins. In the early 20th century the Manor House was divided into two cottages. The Old Manor House to the south was then extended to the rear. The northern half of the building appears to have been rebuilt as a single storey bungalow.

The existing dwelling features white render on the frontage and brickwork on the side elevation (southern elevation). The dwelling is prominent on the street scene along Main Street, the main route into Whitton.

The proposed two storey extension would extend the existing dwelling southwards. The extension would approximately double the size of the existing dwelling. The

extension follows the building line of the existing dwelling along the site frontage, and is therefore adjacent to the boundary with Main Street.

Paragraph 1.9 of the North Lincolnshire's Household Extension Guidance (SPG1) sets out the following:

“1.9 Care must be taken particularly when extending older properties to ensure that their character is not spoilt through the addition of inappropriately designed extensions. Extensions should not dominate the original building in scale, materials or situation. Indeed, the most successful extensions in visual terms are ones where the extension appears as if it has always been part of the house.”

Given that the proposed extension would approximately double the size of the existing dwelling, it is considered that the extension would dominate the original dwelling.

The street scene features a mixture of dwelling types and sizes, some of which are located next to the road and others are set back. It is considered that the extension would have a detrimental impact on the street scene. The extension will be situated adjacent to the pavement and will feature prominently on the approach into Whitton.

The proposed extension features a glazed link connecting the extension with the main dwelling. The proposed extension would significantly alter the character of the existing dwelling which is of a traditional appearance. The extension comprises a contemporary design that would be at odds with the character of the area. The new extension will harm the character and appearance of the Old Manor House including its contribution to the local character and distinctiveness of Whitton. The proposed glazed link and modern appearance of the extension is not considered to be in keeping with the character of the street scene.

In the immediate vicinity there is the Grove listed grade II Farmhouse (18th century or earlier origins) and two historic barns are located to the north of the Grove opposite the Old Manor House and one to the north of the Old Manor House. These buildings combine to create a traditional street scene in the village and make a significant contribution to local character and distinctiveness of Whitton. The new large modern extension will stand out overtly and clash with the surrounding historic buildings and harm the local character and distinctiveness of Whitton.

The proposed scale, design and appearance of the two storey side extension is considered to be inappropriate in terms of its impact on the street scene and as such conflicts with policies DS5 and CS5.

Heritage Impact

Policy CS6 (Historic Environment) sets out that the Council will seek to protect, conserve and enhance North Lincolnshire's historic environment, including the character and setting of listed buildings and scheduled ancient monuments.

Policy HE5 (Development affecting Listed Buildings) seeks to encourage the retention and restoration of the historic setting of listed buildings.

The council's Conservation Officer has reviewed the proposals and considers that the design is in appropriate.

It is considered that the siting and design of the proposed extension would negatively impact the setting of the grade II listed The Grove.

The NPPF defines setting as the following (Page 71):

“The surroundings in which a heritage asset is experienced. Its extent is not fixed and may change as the asset and its surroundings evolve. Elements of a setting may make a positive or negative contribution to the significance of the asset, may affect the ability to appreciate that significance or may be neutral.”

The Old Manor House is part of the surroundings in which a heritage asset is experienced. As you view the listed Grove from Main Street looking northwards, you see the Old Manor House behind it. As a period property built in the late 17th century it adds to the character of the setting of the Grove and makes a positive contribution to its significance.

Whilst it has been extended and added to, the additions have been designed to respect the character and appearance of the building and key views to the building.

The historic setting also includes two historic barns, one immediately to the north of the Grove opposite the Old Manor House, and one to the north of the Old Manor House. These buildings are shown on 1887 OS map. These historic buildings have shared settings, each contributing to the historic character of the other.

The new extension will impede views to the historic original gable with its tumbled brickwork and harm the appreciation of the 17th century building including the ability to interpret it as an historic asset.

The modern style extension is seen as a significant modern discordant feature.

The proposed extension is therefore unacceptable in heritage terms as it would have a negative impact on the setting of the listed Grove building. As such the proposed extension does not accord with Policies CS6 and HE5.

Residential Amenity

Policy DS1 (General Requirements) requires proposals to be assessed to ensure they would not result in an unacceptable impact or loss of amenity to neighbouring land uses including as a result of the effects of overlooking or overshadowing.

Policy DS5 requires extensions to be designed to as not to unreasonably reduce sunlight or daylight, or result in overshadowing, overbearing or loss of privacy to adjacent dwellings.

The front of the dwelling faces onto Main Street and a brick wall attached to a barn at Grove Farm.

The proposed two storey extension would extend the property further into the plot (to the east). It is considered that the extension would have an acceptable impact on the amenity of Manor Cottage to the north of the site, given that the rear part of the extension is single storey which reduces the potential for overlooking or overshadowing the property.

Keepers Cottage is approximately 11m to the south east of the proposed two storey part of the extension. A floor length window is proposed on the first floor of the extension that would overlook part of Keepers Cottage, though this would be over the front garden. There is a 1.3m fence and vegetation between the properties to provide some screening between Keepers Cottage and the southern elevation of the proposed extension.

Having considered the scale of the extension and the location of windows on the southern elevation, it is considered that the proposals would have an acceptable impact on the amenity of neighbouring properties.

Conclusion

The proposed extension is considered to be of an inappropriate scale and design that does not respond to the context of the street scene. The proposed extension would have a detrimental impact on the setting of the Grove which is a grade II listed building.

RECOMMENDATION: Refuse permission

1. The siting, scale and appearance of the side extension are not acceptable. The design is not sympathetic to the existing dwelling or the character of the area. The extension is considered to have a detrimental impact on the character of the street scene and is therefore considered to be contrary to policies DS1 and DS5 of the Local Plan, and policy CS5 of the Core Strategy and the SPG1 Design Guidance for House Extensions.
2. The proposed extension would harm the setting of the Grove, a grade II listed building near to the site including its contribution to the local character and distinctiveness of Whitton. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Policies HE5 and CS6 and Paragraph 202 of the National Planning Policy Framework.