

Reference:	PA/2023/1034	Application Type:	Outline Planning Permission
Address:	Osgerby Haulage Repair Garage, Waterside Road, Barton Upon Humber, DN18 5BH	Description:	Outline planning application, with all matters reserved, for a change of use of existing vacant brownfield commercial land to residential housing land and erect 38 dwellings and associated roads, driveways, gardens, landscaping and boundary treatments
		Date of Response:	13/5/2024
		Case Officer:	Tanya Coggon
Heritage/Conservation Considerations:			
<p>Designated Heritage Assets: 43 – 49 Waterside Road, Grade II Listed Building – NHLE Ref: 1346818 Windmill and Adjacent House to West, Grade II Listed Building – NHLE Ref: 1039878</p> <p>Non-Designated Built Heritage Assets: N/A</p>			
Advice/Comments:			
<p>The outline application is for erection of 38 no dwellings on an brownfield site. The site is situated adjacent 43-49 Waterside Road a group of Grade II Listed Buildings, further away but viewed in conjunction with the site is the nearby listed windmill.</p> <p>These comments relate to new information provided dated 7th May, relating to the layout of the proposed development as well as indicative elevations and street-scene analysis assessing the height of new development against the existing buildings including the listed terrace and windmill tower.</p> <p>Layout The noting of the preservation of a positive view of the listed windmill tower through the proposed development from close to Plot 19, a view which is also notable from St. Chads’s Way is a positive feature of the development.</p> <p>Street-scene Analysis The general principle put forward here regarding the heights of Plots 1 – 5 that would in-fill the site between the listed terrace and terrace of houses starting at No 57 is acceptable. The reduced height would ensure the new building would not visually detract from the presence of the listed terrace in the street-scene. There is room for improvement of this through, the slight stepping back of the new terrace back from the pavement would create further visual separation mitigating impact on the setting of the listed terrace.</p> <p>Indicative Design The form of Plots 1 – 5 looks to mirror that of the listed terrace through mirroring of the part hipped, part pitched roofscape, and use of a feature glazing on Plot 1 to mirror the shopfront</p>			

feature of 49 Waterside Road. This as a principle is acceptable as a design approach to integrating a new development in this setting.

The general design of these plots proposed red brick and red clay pantile roof tiles, which is typical of the Lincolnshire vernacular and subject to securing the detail of materials again is a generally acceptable principle. Similarly, this is the same of use of aluminium rainwater goods, which given a more authentic appearance than “cast iron effect uPVC” when formed of extruded sections as opposed to cut and welded joints.

With regard the indicative design of fenestration and doors the use of windows and doors of a contemporary style is not appropriate here and would harm the setting of the terrace of listed buildings. Attempt to exactly replicate the design of the listed terrace would also be inappropriate here, ultimately devaluing the original article.

An appropriate design approach here would be to draw from the many examples of good quality Georgian houses found within Barton-upon-Humber to provide authentic Georgian style dwellings comprising of panelled doors, sash windows and suitable sills, lintels etc. Such a design approach has been utilised to good effect within North Lincolnshire at 10 – 12 Bridge Street, Brigg as well as 41 – 48 Bigby Street, Brigg the design and materials utilised here assimilate well into the surroundings which contains a range of listed buildings and also sits within a conservation area. In a revised design, if a replica shopfront is put forward as a replacement for the proposed glazed feature on Plot 1 – such a shopfront should be based upon design of a Victorian shopfront, the rarity of original Georgian shopfronts means their replication without precedent devalues the original article where found.

Principally the design of Plots 1 – 5 would have the most visible impact upon the significance of the listed terrace. The wider development would alter the setting of the listed buildings but the impact would be less harmful on its setting, though it should be noted alongside other new development around Mill View the addition of further contemporary style dwellings will cause cumulative harm. I note comments from the previous Conservation Officer advising of the negative impact of modern design in the developments of Mill View to the immediate south of the listed windmill.

The provision of a scheme with a cohesive and consistent design scheme that respects the significance of identified heritage assets and the well defined historic character of buildings within the wider town of Barton-upon-Humber must be sought here to avoid the further addition of a discordant modern development.

The design in its present iteration will harm the significance of the listed buildings, the level of harm is less than substantial however would be consequential if not addressed through design revisions. The proposal contravenes the requirement of section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, nor does the design meet relevant local plan policies HE5 or CS6. Under national planning policy, great weight should be given to the conservation of the heritage assets – the relevant paragraphs here are 205, 206 and 208.

Relevant Legislation/ Policy/ Guidance

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 Section 66
North Lincolnshire Local Plan Adopted 2003 HE5, CS6
National Planning Policy Framework Para 201. 205,

Reviewed by:	Felix Mayle MA Dist IHBC	Date:	13/5/2024
---------------------	--------------------------	--------------	-----------